

APPROVED

**ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
Regular Session Thursday, January 12, 2006**

Council Chambers, City Hall - 100 North Fifth Avenue, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48104

Commissioners Present: Gary L. Cooper, H. Mark Hildebrandt, Susan Wineberg, Michele Derr, Michael Bruner, Jim Henrichs and Robert White (7)

Commissioners Absent: None.

Staff Present: Donna Franklin Johnson, Planner II, Planning and Development Services, and Brenda Acquaviva, Administrative Support Specialist IV.

Review Committee: Commissioners Henrichs and Derr.

CALL TO ORDER:

Commissioner Bruner called the meeting to order at 7:05 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

Quorum satisfied.

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA:

Moved by Commissioner White, Seconded by Commissioner Wineberg
"To approve the agenda as presented" - *On a Voice Vote* – **MOTION TO APPROVE - PASSED**
– Unanimous

A – HEARINGS

A-1 519 South First Street (OWSHD)

BACKGROUND: This two-story frame house has one-story porch, both with gable-ends facing the street, six-over-six windows on the second floor located symmetrically above the first floor window and front door, and a side addition with gable extending to the south. It is first listed around 1888 as the home of John Herrman, a mason, and subsequently occupied by his widow, Augusta. It is first shown on the 1908 Sanborn map and again in 1916, but with a substantially greater footprint.

LOCATION: The site is located on the east side of First Street, between William and Jefferson Streets.

APPLICATION: The applicant requests approval to add a two-story addition on the northeast rear corner, adding 490 new square feet to the house, and a one-story addition on the southeast rear corner (replacing an existing 100 square foot sun porch). The northeast addition would provide a family/bedroom on the first floor and a master bedroom on the second. The southeast addition would provide a breakfast room. The northeast roofline would maintain and extend the existing roof pitch to the east; the southeast roofline would replicate the pitch of the shed roof of

52 the kitchen. Both additions would extend east from the existing side facades and siding would
 53 match existing vinyl siding. The additions are located approximately 18 feet from the front of the
 54 house.

55
 56 **Review Committee:** Commissioners Hildebrandt and Bruner visited the site.
 57
 58 Commissioner Hildebrandt – Home has two different foundations – stone and brick – the
 59 additions that are proposed are well set back from the street, are consistent with the style of the
 60 house and the addition of the breakfast nook is consistent with the current regulations. I didn't
 61 see a particular problem with this and I would favor it.

62
 63 Commissioner Bruner – Concurs with Commissioner Hildebrandt.

64
 65 **Owner:** John and Caroline Berge

66
 67 **Applicant Presentation:** None.

68
 69 **Audience Participation:** None.

70
 71 **Questions by the Commission:**

72
 73 Commissioner Wineberg – On the back where the tyvek is, is that over clapboard or was the
 74 clapboard removed?

75 (Applicant) – Originally it was clapboard and covered over with asphalt shingles.
 76

77 Commissioner Hildebrandt - Are you planning to put on vinyl siding?

78 (Applicant) – Yes, the same that's on the rest of the house. The other vinyl was put on in 2005.
 79

80 Commissioner Derr – I noticed there were no specifications for materials, and my assumption
 81 was it was because it was beyond our pervue, and the only reason it's before us now is due to
 82 it's size?

83 (Coordinator) – Yes. If it were fifty square feet smaller, it would have been Administratively
 84 approved. I believe the rule is, when it exceeds the first floor footprint by more than fifty percent
 85 (which it does).
 86

87 **MOVED** by Commissioner Derr, Seconded by Commissioner White “to approve the
 88 application to add a two-story addition on the northeast rear corner and a one-story
 89 addition on the southeast rear corner of the house at 519 South First Street,
 90 approximately 18 feet from the front facade, per the attached drawings and as generally
 91 compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest
 92 of the building and to the surrounding area and as meeting the Secretary of Interior's
 93 Standards numbers 9 and 10.”
 94

95 Commissioner Wineberg – (Commented the home's probable history). It appeared on an 1880
 96 birds-eye map, and not on earlier ones, and there was no development on this block until after
 97 the Civil War. It's probably one of the first houses built on this street, and the portion with the
 98 brick foundation is probably the earlier part of the home, and guessing that the side wing was
 99 added in the 1880's, as it has the fieldstone foundation. It could have been a porch that later
 100 became enclosed. The home actually looks like an 1850's home. I think this is a very good
 101 addition, and I'm fully in support of it.
 102

103 Commissioner Cooper – Commissioner Wineberg mentioned that the front of it is unusual in that
 104 the wing where the gable parallels the street is flush with the wing that’s perpendicular to the
 105 street. That’s really odd. When they extend the gable front straight back, they’ll be extending
 106 that side. They’ve not jogged that back or distinguished the existing from the new. That is one
 107 thing that disappoints me – now we will have a much longer façade, with additional windows, the
 108 siding will continue and there won’t be any differentiation from the later addition. It may become
 109 apparent as the gables are different on the back.

110

111 **Discussion by the Commission:**

112

113 *On a Voice Vote - MOTION TO APPROVE – PASSED – Unanimous*

114

115

116 **A-2 330 South Main Street (OWSHD)**

117

118 **BACKGROUND:** This two-and-a-half story, brick, residential and commercial building,
 119 constructed in 1897 in the Italianate style, was the residence and millinery business of Laura and
 120 Persis Willard. The front features a front dormer with a double-hung one-over-one window, three
 121 irregularly spaced windows on the second floor, and a bay window at street level. At the time of
 122 the 1973 resource photo, the brick had been painted, but was subsequently restored.

123

124 **LOCATION:** The site is located on the west side of S. Main Street, between Liberty and William
 125 Streets, one lot from the south boundary of the District.

126

127 **APPLICATION:** The applicant requests permission to enlarge the north and south side dormers
 128 to provide headroom and egress for two bedrooms to be created on the third floor. The dormers
 129 presently have one double hung, one-over-one windows, identical in style to the front (east)
 130 dormer. The proposed dormers would tie into the existing roof, retaining approximately the same
 131 pitch as the existing dormers, but widened from 3.5 feet to 11.5 feet (outside dimensions), and
 132 raised approximately one foot higher than the peak of the original dormers. They are located
 133 approximately 20 feet from the Main Street façade and would have minimal visibility from the
 134 street due to surrounding structures and height above the street.

135

136 **Review Committee:** Commissioners Hildebrandt and Bruner visited the site.

137

138 Commissioner Hildebrandt – The house already has dormers on the North and South sides, and
 139 these just appear to be enlargements of the existing dormers. The only problem I had with it was
 140 putting a double window in there. It does not really follow the pattern of windows we see on this
 141 building. If the window is needed for more light in the room, that is an acceptable condition.
 142 These dormers are pretty innocuous, and the one on the North is not very visible from the street,
 143 so I don’t see an issue.

144

145 Commissioner Bruner – I agree as well.

146

147 **Owner:** Terry Wolf

148

149 **Applicant Presentation:** None.

150

151 **Audience Participation:** None.

152

153 **Questions by the Commission:**

154 Commissioner Wineberg – The print on the dormer enlargement section was extremely
155 tiny. I can't read any of this, so I'd like it read to me. It looks like 'foam insulation baffle?'

156
157 Commissioner Cooper – Can you tell us what kind of windows you'll use? It says 'as
158 specified herein,' but then we don't find any specifications. Will they be aluminum clad,
159 wood? It says "windows specified per plan," but when we look at the plan, it gives us the
160 size for the windows, but it doesn't tell us what kind or makeup they are, vinyl, wood,
161 aluminum clad.

162 (Applicant) - Anderson Windows, but I'm unable to detail what kind of windows as the
163 designer is unable to be here tonight, and he has the materials list and the specifications.
164 I believe they are aluminum clad.

165
166 Has this been run by the Building Department? Are you fairly confident that this
167 apartment will be approved?

168 (Applicant) – I think the reason for the double windows is because of the egress
169 requirements. There is a fire escape between the two buildings on the North side, and
170 that is where there would be an egress out of the reconstructed dormer.

171
172 I don't think egress requires two; one window would be sufficient, but I was asking if
173 you've had enough discussion with the Building Department to get this approved if we
174 approve it?

175 (Applicant) – I believe so. The designer and I have had several conversations with them
176 and Mr. Tony Savoni.

177
178 Commissioner Wineberg – This is unoccupied attic space right now?
179 (Applicant) – Correct.

180
181 (Coordinator) – I had conversation with Anthony Savoni about this, and part of the reason
182 that they're expanding and bringing up is that they get enough headroom to make it an
183 'occupy able' space. Right now the ceiling is not high enough to have the minimum
184 ceiling height.

185
186 **MOVED** by Commissioner Hildebrandt, Seconded by Commissioner White, "to approve
187 the application to enlarge the North and South side dormers of the structure at 330 S.
188 Main Street as generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material
189 and relationship to the rest of the structure and to the surrounding area and as meeting
190 the Secretary of Interior's Standards numbers 2 and 9."

191
192 Commissioner Wineberg – I'll read this background I have on this home. I was hired by a
193 previous owner to research the history of the house, which I wrote in 2001. "The brick house at
194 330 S. Main Street was built around 1883 as the home and business of two sisters, Laura and
195 Persis Willard, who were milliners. The sisters had been in the millinery business since 1868,
196 when they were located at the Southeast corner of Main and Washington.

197
198 The business was located there throughout the 1870's. The first City directory of the 1880's was
199 1883, and they were listed at 63 S. Main Street, which is this address. It changed to 80 S. Main
200 Street and then 330 S. Main Street in 1898. This is when all the streets were renumbered. The
201 lots to the North were still empty and the buildings nearby were all houses – used both for
202 residences and offices, mainly for doctors. This all changed by the 1920's.

203

204 The millinery business of hat making and some dress-making is one of the few businesses that
 205 was run by and for women. The classifieds in the older city directories show many women
 206 running millinery shops in the area of S. Main, E. Liberty and E. Washington. In 1898, there
 207 were ten milliners and several were nearby in the 300 block of S. Main. This occupation
 208 remained a popular one for women into the 1950's.

209
 210 By 1905, the sisters had died or retired, and Dr. E.A. Clark maintained his residence and practice
 211 here. His 1920 entry in the city directory states he's a physician and surgeon, married to Anna
 212 and has office hours from 2 to 4 and 7 to 8 p.m. Mornings and Sunday's by appointment only. In
 213 1930, Rendels upholstery and Mrs. Clark Shelters were listed, and in 1940, the Electric Service
 214 Company is listed.

215
 216 In 1950, there are four apartments. In 1960, the office of Ann Arbor Real Estate was downstairs,
 217 and three apartments were also listed. In the 1980's Lovin' Spoonful ice cream store was
 218 located in the commercial space. In July, 1999, Nancy Chenevy moved her Regrets Only
 219 stationary and card shop into that space. I don't know when the Chocolate Shop moved in.

220

221 **Discussion by the Commission:**

222

223 Discussion included what type of design was on the front of the house, whether this home
 224 originally had the dormers on it, whether it originally had a cornice on it, was the roof original,
 225 was a flare taken off which makes the appearance much different.

226

227 *On a Voice Vote - MOTION TO APPROVE – PASSED – Unanimous*

228

229

230 **B – REQUESTS FOR REHEARING**

231

232 None.

233

234

235 **C - APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

236

237 **C-1 – November 9, 2005**

238

239 Changes and Corrections: Lines 277 & 351

240

241 **Moved by Commissioner White, Seconded by Commissioner Derr** "to accept the minutes of
 242 the December 2005 Regular Session as amended.

243

244 *On a Voice Vote – MOTION PASSED - Unanimous*

245

246 **D - OLD BUSINESS**

247

248 **D-1 205 North Division (OFWHD)**

249

250 **BACKGROUND:** See November 2005 staff report for background information and location.

251

252 **APPLICATION:** The application was tabled at the November 2005 HDC meeting pending
 253 receipt and review of additional architectural details. Revised drawings have been provided and
 254 the proposal modified to address Commissioners' comments.

255 The proposal is to replace six basement level windows and add window wells (east, south and
256 west facades), to replace one filled window opening with an egress door in the same opening
257 and construct access steps (west façade), and to change one door opening into a window
258 opening, removing steps and roof canopy and creating a window well (north façade). All
259 construction is proposed for egress and emergency egress for the basement level apartment
260 unit.

261
262 Coordinator – (Restated background information on what had happened previously before the
263 Commission). The Commission wanted more clarification in the details so that it would be easy
264 to call out which window was going to be put where and so forth. Also, some changes on the
265 East wall, and the petitioner has done that. These are additional details that were provided.

266
267 **Review Committee:** The Commission visited the site previously.

268
269 **Owner:** One Hundred Twelves LLC, C/O Madison Properties, 1712 South State, Ann
270 Arbor, MI 48104

271
272 **Applicant:** Andrew Hauptman, AIA, 360 Design, LLC, 325 East Eisenhower, Suite 13, Ann
273 Arbor, MI 48108 (Architect)

274
275 **Applicant Presentation:** None.

276
277 **Audience Participation:** None.

278
279 **Questions by the Commission:**

280
281 Commissioner White – We looked at this property previously, and on the West side of the home
282 there was a door and two windows on each side. What were your plans for that?

283 (Applicant) – Everyone agreed that it would be preferred to remove the awning above the stairs,
284 and I did verify with the building department that the interpretation of the code shows that we
285 don't need it, so we're just going to get rid of it.

286
287 (Applicant) – There was also an issue with a modification to one of the double windows that was
288 centered below, and we were going to split it up, make it wider, which would make it off-center.
289 The reason for that was to add a second bedroom in the basement. The owner has decided that
290 they would scrap the bedroom, as the Commission didn't prefer that from an architectural
291 perspective.

292
293 We're leaving the two windows as is, but making them deeper for the egress requirements.
294 There are no masonry modifications at all except for lowering the sill height. On the North side,
295 we have an existing awning that we will be removing, and that door will no longer be used as a
296 door, but will become a window well.

297
298 Commissioner Cooper – The elevation on sketch 11. You have a guardrail around it, then a
299 handrail that follows the steps down. You're suggesting that the guardrail is going to attach to
300 the building? Can you do it in such a way that it wouldn't attach to the building? Also, you had
301 previously stated there would be no saw-cutting of the openings. You'll reshape or reset the
302 stones to form the jams of the windows?

303 (Applicant) – Yes. I agree, it should not be attached to the building, it should have a return in the
304 front of the building. It is also correct that there will be no saw cutting.

305

306 Commissioner Wineberg – Repairs to the front stairs?
 307 (Applicant) –Yes, there are definitely areas that are in need of repairs.

308
 309 Commissioner Henrichs – The windows on sketch 10 show the brick facing on the sides of the
 310 deepened window wells, but the door doesn't. Is there a reason for that?

311 (Applicant) – Because of the depth and the costs involved. There is no 'technical' reason.

312
 313 **MOVED** by Commissioner Wineberg, Seconded by Commissioner White “to approve the
 314 application to replace six basement level windows and add window wells, to replace one
 315 window opening with an egress door in the same opening and construct access steps,
 316 and to modify a door opening into a window opening for the house located at 205 North
 317 Division, as per specifications and drawings as generally compatible in exterior design,
 318 arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the structure and to the
 319 surrounding area, and as meeting the Secretary of Interior's Standards numbers 2 and 9.”

320
 321 Commissioner Wineberg - This is such an important building, and I'm glad to see that they took
 322 our advice for modifying the building. The house was designed by Gordon Lloyd who did St.
 323 Andrew's Church and Forrest Hills Cemetery. It's an important corner where there are four
 324 fabulous examples of different historic architecture. I'm hoping that they also repair the missing
 325 pieces of the balustrade on the front porch and the steps.

326
 327 Commissioner Cooper – We're happy that the owner has responded to the changes we've asked
 328 for. There are going to be significant changes that will be happening to that building.

329

330 *On a Voice Vote – MOTION PASSED – Unanimous*

331

332 **E - NEW BUSINESS**

333

334 **E-1 – Arnold and Gertrude Goss House – 3215 West Dobson Place -**
 335 **Request for Comments from MSHPO Regarding Nomination for National Register**
 336 **of Historic Places.**

337

338 The City has received information from the State Historic Preservation Office requesting the
 339 City's review of the nomination for the Arnold and Gertrude Goss House for listing in the National
 340 Register of Historic Places. I have enclosed the forms and a copy of the application for your
 341 information and review. The owners, Sally and Ian Bund, are hoping that approval action can be
 342 taken at the scheduled February 10, 2006 meeting of the State review board and the City's
 343 review if a part of that process. I have also included the Secretary of Interior qualifying criteria.

344

345 **LOCATION:** The site is located north of Glazier Road between Huron Parkway and Green
 346 Roads.

347

348 **MOVED:** “Having reviewed the application for the Arnold and Gertrude Goss House and
 349 its adjoining properties, located at 3215 West Dobson Place in the City of Ann Arbor, for
 350 inclusion in the National Register of Historic Places, having read the documentation of its
 351 history and significance, and having visited the subject property, the Ann Arbor Historic
 352 Preservation Commission hereby finds that the proposal meets Criteria B and C and
 353 supports its inclusion in the National Register of Historic Places.”

354

355 (Owner Sally Bund gave a slideshow presentation) – The home is not currently in an historic
 356 district, but the owner is requesting registration on the national registry of historic places.

357 (The Commission overall is very pleased that this house will be on the National Register and are
 358 happy to support the issue. They feel that the house and grounds are very special.)

359

360 Vote – **PASSED** - Unanimous

361

362 **F - REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS**

363

364 Commissioner Wineberg –

365

366 *Lower Town – City Council postponed the issue until May when they want to discuss passing it
 367 as a part of “Hiring a District Coordinator.” I also attended the Caucus meeting the Sunday prior
 368 to this particular City Council meeting, and this “linking” of the district with the Coordinator was
 369 not mentioned – so, we were kind of surprised that it went in this direction.

370

371 *The Awards Committee is meeting next Thursday, January 19th).

372

373 *New Construction on empty lots – At the Caucus I was asked if the Commission approved “New
 374 Construction on Empty Lots?” One of the people who lived on Swift Street was concerned that
 375 they wouldn’t be able to build on an empty lot. I said, yes they could, named a few examples,
 376 and one of those brought up was 1315 Hill Street, which one of the Council people thought was
 377 “too bad, and too modern and how did we think that that ‘fit in’ with the rest of the neighborhood.”

378

379 The most important thing he said was that the developer was “required” to make it modern. I
 380 simply told them that this was NOT TRUE, and sent them the minutes to substantiate that. I
 381 thought the building was up, but there is nothing there! All these people are saying this is
 382 ‘hideous,’ yet they haven’t even put a hole in the ground. They are, however, advertising in the
 383 Michigan Daily, with a picture of the building saying “Fall Leasing.”

384

385 Commissioner Bruner – It is true that when they (1315 Hill Street) came to us in a working
 386 session, the Architect started right off the bat with the question that the building ‘could be’
 387 modern, or how would we ‘receive’ something that was historic vs. something modern. By the
 388 Secretary of Interior’s Standards, New construction should be “of its time.” That is certainly the
 389 case with this project. We did trying to direct the Architect in a number of ways without being
 390 difficult or draconian, to get them to ‘acknowledge’ the character of the neighborhood, but he
 391 brought in what he wanted, and we were persuaded to see that it wasn’t entirely objectionable.
 392 We all had statements about the roofline, a cornice, something that would separate the building
 393 from the sky in the manner of every other building in the neighborhood, regardless of what time
 394 period it was from. It became how it appears, which is a very close copy of a building designed
 395 by Louis Kahn for the Brynmawr campus in Pennsylvania thirty years ago.

396

397 Commissioner Cooper – It was very clear from the beginning that they wanted a modern
 398 building, and they were not directed by us in that aspect.

399

400 Commissioner Hildebrandt – We did approve another ‘modern building’ on the corner of Detroit
 401 Street and Kingsley that hasn’t been built yet.

402

403 Commissioner Derr – I didn’t think that they really had any plan to bring in anything that looked
 404 ‘pseudo old’ – which we felt was better, but we didn’t direct them.

405

406 **G - STAFF ACTIVITIES REPORT**

407

408 **G-1** December 2005 - Attached was a listing of 'Administrative Approvals' done
 409 without coming to the HDC for approval.

410
 411 **H – ASSIGNMENTS**

412
 413 **MONITORS:**

414 Commissioner Cooper (A-1) – 519 South First Street
 415 Commissioner Bruner (A-2) – 330 South Main Street
 416 Commissioner Wineberg (D-1) – 205 North Division Street
 417

418 **I - REVIEW COMMITTEE** - for Monday, February 6, 2006 at 12:00 p.m. for the February 9,
 419 2006 meeting.

420
 421 Commissioners Derr and Henrichs
 422

423 **J - CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS**

424
 425 Commissioner Hildebrandt – Retiring from the Commission next month. My second term will be
 426 up in February.

427
 428 Commissioner Henrichs - April meeting date should be the 11th (a Tuesday) and not Monday as
 429 stated in the calendar of events. (Secretary will correct).

430
 431 Commissioner Derr – We need to be thinking about our “Retreat,” which we do in March?
 432

433 Commissioner Wineberg – Need a session with City Council to straighten out a lot of
 434 ‘misinformation’ that we could correct regarding the Commission, Lower Town, Calthorpe and
 435 various issues such as the Historic District Ordinances.

436
 437 (Coordinator will check with the Planning Manager to arrange for City Council to have a meeting
 438 with the HDC and couple that information as a joint session to the HDC yearly retreat.)
 439

440 **K - COMMUNICATIONS** –

441
 442 Commissioner Bruner – Reads notification of a hearing for Glen-Ann Place and LLC. A formal
 443 hearing will be held on January 24th, 2006.

444
 445 Coordinator – Attorney’s Office is working diligently on this hearing.
 446

447 **Motion to adjourn by Commissioner Cooper, Seconded by Commissioner White** -

448 *On a Voice Vote – MOTION PASSED - Unanimous*

449
 450 Meeting ended at 8:15 P.M.

451 Minutes prepared by: B. Acquaviva, Administrative Support Specialist IV